

# TEXT, CONTEXT, AND AUDIENT PERSPECTIVES POETRY BUT NOT WE HAVE DENNY J.A WORKS

Amril Canrhas

*Faculty of Teacher Training and Education, University of Bengkulu  
E-mail: canrhasamril@rocketmail.com*

**Abstract:** Literary work is a document that records culture throughout time. The record reflects the environment, race, time and the author. Through literary work, human civilization can be studied, human problems, expectations, and anxieties. This paper discusses poetry entitled But Not We Have Deny J.A's work. from the point of view of the text, context and perspective of the audience (audience response). From the point of view of the text, poetry, but not us, has transparent poetry, satire, revealing social issues to issues of national life that are in an alarming condition. Poetry But Not We Have because the transfiguration of the language makes the poetry easy to understand the context and other related texts. As stated in the title, the context of poetry, But Not We Have is the problem of the people, even the state, where the economic centers are no longer controlled by the children of the nation (us: the people), but foreigners or descendants, that is what is said with an expression but not we. The people are in a foreign condition in their country. Poetry But Not We Have after the reading of Palima TNI Gen. Gatot Nurmantyo with audience members of the Golongan Karya party, was seen by audiences as bad poetry criticizing the government. The controversy, using the Hermeneutic Schleirmacher theory, arose because the audience used its perspective: prejudice.

**Keywords:** *Text, Context, Perspective of poetry audience*

Poetry is a social document, same as the other literature. As a social document, it's reflects the life and the problems in life, human and humanitarian issues of the times, the period of time the work was written. Any literary work on the genre is responsive to writers on these issues. That is why Teeuw (1997: 2) states that the writer is always present in his creation with the overall humanity, likes and sorrows, dreams and stones, success and failure. It is means that reading and understanding literary works is understanding the problems of life, human problems and humanity at certain times.

Denny Januar Ali or well known as Denny J.A, born in Palembang, South Sumatra in 1963. He is a political consultant and social media figure. He is active in social media and becomes a writer on social and political issues in Indonesia. He has many survey institutions and political consulting companies. In 2014, it was awarded by Twitter Inc. as *The World's second Golden Tweet 2014*, and got the first place in Indonesia MURI as the world's first political consultant who helped win the presidential election three times in a row, namely in the 2004, 2009 and 2014 general elections.

In the same year, Eight Team (a team of poets, critics and academics) included Denny JA were in a list of containing influential literary figures in Indonesia, it's named '*33 the most influential literary figure in Indonesia*'. The list triggered controversy on the part of writers.

Denny J.A can be said to be the most productive and creative writer at that moment. No wonder it became a new phenomenon in Indonesian literature. Because his creativity is different from the previous poetry tradition, it has become a controversy. His emergence in the world of literature brings the ideas that are intellectually challenging and creatively. He introduced what he called poetry essays, which he conceptually formulated in such a way and creatively carried out by himself through his essay poetry book, *On Atas Nama Cinta* (2012).

Denny J.A's poem titled "But Not We Have" is the most quoted and read in public as well as compulsory poetry or choice in various poetry reading competitions in the country. This paper examines Poetry "But Not We Have" Denny J.A's work in perspective Poetry text, its context and the response of the reader or audience.

This essay's poetry book talks about social discrimination with its victims. Therefore, it is a resistance to various forms of social discrimination, especially in the Indonesian context. Equally important, in subsequent developments there were many people writing essay poems, both through poetry writing essays and special requests.

**1. Poem Text *But Not We Have* by Denny J.A.**

**Tapi Bukan Kami Punya**

oleh Denny JA

Sungguh Jaka tak mengerti  
Mengapa ia dipanggil polisi  
Ia datang sejak pagi  
Katanya akan diinterogasi  
Dilihatnya Garuda Pancasila  
Tertempel di dinding dengan gagah  
Terpana dan terdiam si Jaka  
Dari mata burung garuda  
Ia melihat dirinya  
Dari dada burung garuda  
Ia melihat desa  
Dari kaki burung garuda  
Ia melihat kota  
Dari kepala burung garuda  
Ia melihat Indonesia  
Lihatlah hidup di desa  
Sangat subur tanahnya  
Sangat luas sawahnya  
Tapi Bukan Kami Punya  
Lihat padi menguning  
Menghiasi bumi sekeliling  
Desa yang kaya raya  
Tapi Bukan Kami Punya  
Lihatlah hidup di kota  
Pasar swalayan tertata  
Ramai pasarnya  
Tapi Bukan Kami Punya  
Lihatlah aneka barang  
Dijual belikan orang  
Oh makmurnya  
Tapi Bukan Kami Punya  
Jaka terus terpana  
Entah mengapa  
Menetes air mata  
Air mata itu Ia yang Punya  
-000-  
Masuklah petinggi polisi  
Siapkan lakukan interogasi  
Kok Jaka menangis?  
Padahal ia tidak bengis?  
Jaka pemimpin demonstran  
Aksinya picu kerusuhan  
Harus dialami lagi dan lagi  
Apakah ia bagian konspirasi?  
Apakah ini awal dari makar?  
Jangan sampai aksi membesar?  
Mengapa pula isu agama  
Dijadikan isu bersama?  
Mengapa pula ulama?  
Menjadi inspirasi mereka?

Dua jam lamanya  
 Jaka diwawancara  
 Kini terpana pak polisi  
 Direnungkannya lagi dan lagi  
 Terngiang ucapan Jaka  
 Kami tak punya sawah  
 Hanya punya kata  
 Kami tak punya senjata  
 Hanya punya suara  
 Kami tak tamat SMA  
 Hanya mengerti agama  
 Tak kenal kami penguasa  
 Hanya kenal para ulama  
 Kami tak mengerti  
 Apa sesungguhnya terjadi  
 Desa semakin kaya  
 Tapi semakin banyak saja  
 Yang Bukan Kami Punya  
 Kami hanya kerja  
 Tapi mengapa semakin susah?  
 Kami tak boleh diam  
 Kami harus melawan  
 Bukan untuk kami  
 Tapi untuk anak anak kami  
 -000-  
 Pulanglah itu si Jaka  
 Interogasi cukup sudah  
 Kini petinggi polisi sendiri  
 Di hatinya ada yang sepi  
 Dilihatnya itu burung garuda  
 Menempel di dinding dengan gagah  
 Dilihatnya sila ke lima  
 Keadian sosial bagi seluruh rakyat Indonesia  
 Kini menangis itu polisi  
 Cegugukan tiada henti  
 Dari mulut burung garuda  
 Terdengar merdu suara  
 Lagu Leo kristi yang indah  
 Salam dari Desa  
 Terdengar nada:  
 “Katakan padanya padi telah kembang  
 Tapi Bukan Kami Punya”  
**(But Not We Have**  
 by Denny JA

Jaka didn't understand indeed  
 Why he was called by the police  
 He came since morning  
 He said he would be interrogated  
 He saw Garuda Pancasila  
 Plastered on the wall  
 Stunned and silent Jaka  
 From the eyes of the eagle  
 He saw himself  
 From the chest of the eagle

He saw the village  
From the foot of the eagle  
He saw the city  
From the eagle's head  
He saw Indonesia  
Look at life in the village  
Very fertile soil  
Very wide fields  
But Not We Have  
See yellowing rice  
Decorate the earth around  
Rich village  
But Not We Have  
Look at life in the city  
Supermarkets are organized  
Crowded market  
But Not We Have  
Look at various items  
Buy people  
Oh prosper  
But Not We Have  
Jaka continues to stare  
For some reason  
Tear tears  
The tears that he has  
-000-  
Come in police officers  
Prepare to do interrogation  
How come Jaka cries?  
Even though he isn't violent?  
Jaka the leader of the demonstrators  
The action triggered riots  
Must be explored more  
Is he part of the conspiracy?  
Is this the beginning of treason?  
Don't let the action grow?  
Why also religious issues  
Being a joint issue?  
Why are scholars too?  
Become their inspiration?  
Two hours  
Jaka was interviewed  
Now the police officer is stunned  
Meditate more  
Speaking of Jaka's words  
We don't have rice fields  
Just have a word  
We don't have weapons  
Only have a voice  
We did not finish high school  
Only understand religion  
Do not know us rulers  
Only know the scholars  
We don't understand  
What really happened

The village gets richer  
 But more and more  
 What we do not have  
 We only work  
 But why is it getting harder?  
 We can't be quiet  
 We have to fight  
 Not for us  
 But for our children  
 -000-  
 Go home, Jaka  
 Interrogation is enough  
 Now police officers themselves  
 In his heart there was a quiet one  
 He saw the eagle  
 Sticking to the wall bravely  
 He saw the fifth precept  
 Social events for all Indonesian people  
 Now crying is the police  
 An endless mess  
 From the mouth of the eagle  
 Sound melodious  
 The song Leo Kristi is beautiful  
 Greetings from the village  
 Tone:  
 "Tell him the rice has grown  
 But Not We Have "  
 Mei 2017)

### **Text, Context and Public Response**

Denny J.A. called his poetry as an essay poem that has real events in it, not so long, written at this time, has a footnote and there is a source of information that can be traced. He wrote daily events with a clear plot so it was not difficult to understand his poetry. The poem titled "But Not We Have", tells the story of Jaka, an innocent, poor village boy, who has nothing in the sense of economic growth. Jaka is innocent but he was interrogated by police. Very simple. But Denny J.A. actually not question the incident, but he questioned something behind the incident.

Poetry "But Not We Have" is one of Denny J.A.'s poems the most widely read by artists or art lovers in public, competitions and in cyberspace. So far there has been no criticism in the form of rejection of the poetry reading and text both for the writer and the individual who reads it (even if there is denial of Denny J.A, it's not means because of this poem, but because of essay poetry declaration and the Literary Literature Force). However, the situation became different when General Gatot Nurmantyo read it before a public with a background in politicians and at events related to political activity. Because of that General Gatot Nurmantyo, the situation and the audience went into different responses due to the emergence of different meanings.

Poetry reading "But Not We Have", by the Commander of the Armed Forces General Gatot Nurmantyo in the Golongan Karya Party Leadership Meeting Behind the Board of East Kalimantan, May 23, 2017 became a hot discussion and even controversy. There are those who appreciate, some regret generals reading poetry, even like fire in the pants. This paper tries to look at the audience's responsiveness which makes the event of reading poetry becomes public attention as well as controversy.

The experts of objectivism (structuralist) recognize the value of a poem lies in the poetic text written by the poet. Expressionism experts recognize the value of a poem is determined by who gave birth to it. Pragmatic experts say the value of a literary work (poetry) is determined by

(the experience) of the reader or audience. Other experts say the value of a poem is determined by other texts including context.

The problem is the audience's experience with their various expectations make it a very open discourse that can even not clear discuss. Just look at General Gatot Nurmantyo, the TNI Commander read the poem by Deny J.A. titled "But Not We Have". For anyone who understands poetry with the intricacies of his theory, he will judge that the poetry read at the initiative of Gatot Nurmantyo is a brilliant choice. Why not, the audience is hundreds of regional heads who participated in the debriefing of domestic government leadership for regional heads and deputy regional heads. Those who become the audience are politicians who have been engaged as executive and legislative, clever clever, pious scholars, cultural observers and so on. To the audience, General Gatot Nurmantyo delivered messages with imaginative, artistic language, a model of expression that was different from the daily life of the audience, namely straightforward language, rhetoric, bombas, agitation and so on.

For audiences who watched poetry readings, "But Not We Have" by Deny J.A. there is nothing strange, odd, especially wrong. That is if they understand the social reality in the poem that is read. The meaning is that the general shows a perspective that may be unusual, that is, imaginative and artistic to produce a scene that touches emotions and is harmful.

Then what is the real problem and the message of the poem to give birth to controversy? Poetry "But Not We Have" actually a poem that is very transparent, rather straight forward but satire. Poetically he told of a man named Jaka who lived in a rich country, but whatever wealth in the country, for me the lyrics (Jaka) were not ours (meaning other people). According to textual, the longer, the more we don't have, whatever belongs to someone else: the rice fields in the village are very fertile, the supermarkets in the city, the things we don't have, to the tragic, the dripping tears we have. So transparent is this process that Gatot himself appreciates: The meaning of the poem is a warning to Indonesia to be prepared and alert about global competition. The most dangerous thing now, said Gatot, is immigration from non-refugees.

"Right now the most dangerous thing is immigration. It's not refugee, global competition is competition between people. Humans don't know the boundaries and look for a promising place for the life of the salary theory." Gatot said that by 2050 there will be an estimated 500 million immigration. In 2020 alone there were 60 million people who had begun to leave the Sub Sahara because of drought.

Various anticipations were made by a number of heads of state. As did American President Donald Trump, who closed the access of immigrants from South Africa to enter his territory. Even with Europe and Australia who also do the same thing.

"The results of immigration we see that once in America there are Indians now almost extinct, in Australia there are Aborigines also almost extinct and if we are not vigilant we can be like Jaka," explained Gatot. ([Http://www.tribunnews.com/seleb / 2017/05/21](http://www.tribunnews.com/seleb/2017/05/21)).

Poetry "But Not We Have" has writtten when the DKI Election era, where police were seen interrogating people in certain positions accused of treason, the poet tended to be concerned about criminalized criminals, criticized the authorities:

Masuklah petinggi polisi  
Siapkan lakukan interogasi  
Kok Jaka menangis?  
Padahal ia tidak bengis?  
Jaka pemimpin demonsttran  
Aksinya picu kerusuhan  
Harus dialami lagi dan lagi  
Apakah ia bagian konspirasi?  
Apakah ini awal dari makar?  
Jangan sampai aksi membesar?  
Mengapa pula isu agama  
Dijadikan isu bersama?  
Mengapa pula ulama?  
Menjadi inspirasi mereka?

Dua jam lamanya  
Jaka diwawancara  
Kini terpana pak polisi  
Direnungkannya lagi dan lagi

Come in police officers  
Prepare to do interrogation  
How come Jaka cries?  
Even though he isn't violent?  
Jaka the leader of the demonstrators  
The action triggered riots  
Must be explored more  
Is he part of the conspiracy?  
Is this the beginning of treason?  
Don't let the action grow?  
Why also religious issues  
Being a joint issue?  
Why are scholars too?  
Become their inspiration?  
Two hours  
Jaka was interviewed  
Now the police officer is stunned  
Meditate more

Reading that poem, the reader image leads to the case of the cleric's defense for the past few months, the masses who feel the bible and the ulama are insulted and then demand justice, then accused of further treason a number of figures are arrested, interrogated. That reality appears in the text of this poem. Literary expert named Wolfgang Iser confirmed by stating that the meaning of a poem is always related to what is conveyed by poetry, but demands creative imagination from the reader.

This poetic genetics was born from a poet's understanding of a social reality that has been going on for a long time. Denny J.A. see a systemic system that is and always works, causing a change, an evolution of ownership in life. Systemic is not a coincidence, but is designed in such a way. What happened to the Kingdom of Malaysia which eventually gave birth to the State of Singapore and many other countries that were born from such a system. The systemic is working.

Yusril Ilza Mahendra, during the ILC (Indonesian Lawyer Club, stated that 0, 2 percent of Indonesians control 74 percent of land through various conglomerates. PT. Similarly with Pakistan during the Ali Buto administration, 5 percent of Pakistanis controlled 95 percent of the land in the country. Yusril was a crucial situation, other data put forward by ILC President ILC 0.2 percent of Indonesians controlled 74 percent of the land, which made the situation crucial to the control of non-private entrepreneurs.

Why does the poem read by the Commander make many people like a beard fire? Television media, which is often connoted by the media, has led to the opinion that what Gatot did was something that was excessive, beyond his authority because he was the president's assistant.

### **Transparent Poetry That Becomes Controversy**

Denny J.A Poetry what Gatot Nurmantyo read was poetry transparent, easy to understand. It has the potential to be a poetic monotype. But the reality is to be multi-interpretation. Why?. The answer was raised by experts in pragmatic theory, more specifically reception theory. Every reader or udien has a different experience, has certain texts, has their own expectations. These texts are called other texts which Haliday called context. According to Haliday, the context precedes the text (which is read), the text read is born because there are other texts called context. Each reader moves from his text experience or context and expectations.

Andreas Parera, Chairperson of the PDIP DPP stated that the poem read by the TNI Commander was an incorrect address. He said, the TNI Commander seemed to criticize the

Jokowidodo's government while he was his subordinate. Therefore the reading of the poem is considered unethical because it creates multiple interpretations. The view expressed by Andreas Parera arose because he was positioned as part of the bearer party Jokowi and the text of the poem was indeed impressed as a critic of the authorities who dragged the police to favor the authorities and criminalized the cleric

*Sungguh Jaka tak mengerti  
Mengapa ia dipanggil polisi  
Ia datang sejak pagi  
Katanya akan diinterogasi  
Mengapa pula isu agama  
Dijadikan isu bersama?  
Mengapa pula ulama?  
Menjadi inspirasi mereka?*

Jaka didn't understand indeed  
Why was he called by the police  
He came since morning  
He said he would be interrogated  
Why religious issues  
Being a joint issue?  
Why are clerics too?  
Become their inspiration?

News Republika.co.id, May 23. lowered the article entitled, not only criticizing Denny JA's poetry but criticizing it as bad poetry. The article seemed subjective to denounce Denny J.A as a troubled literary figure, a figure who spent a lot of money to popularize himself. Not only is Denny JA attacked, but also Gatot and those around him who are laymen with poetry so that they read bad poetry. Why not poetry from great writers like Rendra and others. The article is too subjective.

Assessing a poem is certainly not enough with one side, one size. As mentioned earlier, poetry, "But Not We Have", is a transparent, realist poem, then because of its transparency and realism, people object to stating it as a poem that is not qualified. Light as poetry written by beginners. But in my opinion, the transparency, the lightness and innocence of the poem make the various readers awed and there is direct contact between (the texts that are in) the reader experience and the text read by the Commander. Not much inhibits communication between the reader experience and the poem

Whether we realize it or not, recent Indonesian best-seller works have a format like this. Many Indonesian literary experts say that Andrea Hirata's works, Ahmad Fuadi Tere Liye, are exaggerated light literature. But such criticism is proven to be a subjective opinion. The proof is the works that are considered light because the authors were not popular at the time, then suddenly skyrocketed over writers who were very popular, making others become amazed, difficult to accept the reality, then jealous, then gave subjective criticism. Then why does that difference occur. Differences in different and even contradictory public responses occur as a result of prioritizing one's own perspective so that they are prejudiced against poetry, the poet, or the individual who reads it in public.

Bengkulu, August 2018

## **BIBLIOGRAPHY**

- Canrhas, Amril. 202. Agama dan Ilusi: Kajian Atas Novel Larung Karya Ayu Utami. Jakarta: Harian Republika Minggu. 7 Agustus, halaman 8.
- Denny J.A. 2017. *Atas Nama Cinta*, Rene Book.
- Endaswara, Suwardi, 2013. *Teori Kritik Sastra*. Yogyakarta: CAPS (Center For Akademik Publishing).
- Esten, Mursal. 1985. *Kesusastraan: Sebuah Pengantar*. Bandung. Angkasa.



Sebeok, Thomas. 1978. *The Evaluation of Literary Text (An Experimental Investigation into rationalization on value Jugment with Refren to Semiotics and esthetics of Reseption*. Lisse: The Petter de Ridder Press.

Teeuw, A. 1997. *Citra Manusia Indonesia dalam Karya Pramoedya Anantatoer*. Jakarta. Pustaka Jaya.

### **BIODATA**

Amril Canrhas was born in Bukitbual, West Sumatra on 5<sup>th</sup> of August 1959. He has been a lecturer at the Faculty of Teacher Training and Education of Bengkulu University since 1985, he also writing essays in various media. He completed the Indonesian language education program at IKIP Padang in 1983. In 1990 he got a master's degree in science at Padjadjaran University, Bandung. Since 2000 he has assisted the police in Bengkulu for an expert language witnesses.

Contact person : 081373936529

Email : canrhasamril@rocketmail.com

Facebook : Amril Canrha

Office : Faculty of Teacher Training and Education of Bengkulu University,  
W.R. Supratman St. Bengkulu City

Home : W.R. Supratman St. Pematang Gubernur, Bengkulu City